

Master Thesis Opponent's Expert Opinion

Student:	Bc. Matilda Hammond
Student Number:	E15011
Title of the thesis:	Civil Service in EU Institutions
Aim of the thesis:	Analysis of the EU civil servants' legal status, their recruitment, promotion, remuneration and other rights and duties. Protection of civil servants' rights by court will be covered by an analysis of relevant case law. Results of the analysis will be generalized and will serve to advise whether some of the tackled legal institutes can be incorporated into national legislations to reach their improvement
Thesis supervisor:	JUDr. Jana Janderová, Ph.D.
Thesis opponent:	JUDr. Martin Šmíd, Ph.D.
Study programme:	Economic Policy and Administration
Academic year:	2017/2018

The evaluation of the thesis

The author wrote the thesis on the topic „Civil Service in EU Institutions“ with the aim to analyse the legal status, recruitment, promotion, remuneration and other rights and duties of EU civil servants. It should be noted that the formulation of the aim of the thesis on page 11 („The main aim of this thesis is to study and discover the nature of European Union Civil service...“) differs significantly from the formulation in thesis assignment („Analysis of...“).

The thesis is divided into eight chapters. The theoretical background processed in the thesis is sufficient but is basically on the level of bachelor thesis. The same can be said about the scope of the thesis with text starting on page 10 and ending on page 55 (45 pages of the text itself). The practical part of the thesis and its specific contribution lies in analysis of relevant case law. The author found and commented some cases to all topics covered in the thesis but the analysis of these cases is very shallow and simple. It lies just in the description of the facts of the given case and summary of the court's conclusion.

My greatest constraint on the concept of work is the absence of a list of processed judgments in references. It is not clear, therefore, whether the author used the judgments directly, or that their content was drawn from the literature.

Comments on formal aspect of the thesis:

The formal adaptation of the work is poor (different style for the chapter titles of same level – e.g. 1.1 and 1.2; title of Chapter 7) with some unnecessary errors which can be easily corrected (e.g. title of Chapter 4: Eruopean Union traineeship; use of capital letters and italics in references).

I don't understand the independent numbering of the opening pages (i-xii) while the standard text after that starts on the page 10.

The last article of the declaration on page „v“ should correspond to the Czech version with reference to § 47b Act. No 111/1998 Coll. and the University decree 9/2012.

With all these reservations I propose the thesis for defence. But it has to be remarked that the submitted thesis is really on the edge of defensibility. Therefore the performance of the student in front of the Examining Board should be of high quality for the thesis being able to be defended.

Questions and Suggestions for Defence

1) In the annotation of your thesis (page vii), you say, that: „The European Union was established to promote social-political, economic harmony and fight against all forms of social exclusion and discrimination among European countries“. Explain the relevance and importance of this statement in regard to the topic of your thesis (Civil Service in EU institution).

2) In conclusion you say that: „Fundamental rights of the civil servants of European Union institutions are being trampled behind closed doors“. What are the evidences for such a strong statement?

Final Evaluation

I recommend the thesis for the defence.
I propose to grade this thesis as follows: **E**

In Pardubice 28.5.2018

Signature